The endings of television series are often met with critical reactions by fans. An ending makes or breaks a show, and our memory of it (Williams 2015). For example, the final episode of *Breaking Bad* (2008-2013) was praised by fans and critics alike since it tied up all the loose ends perfectly and allowed us to say goodbye to the characters. A more ambiguous, and often discussed, television finale is that of HBO television series *The Sopranos* (1999-2007) which ends with a sudden cut-to-black. During the final scene, the Sopranos arrange to meet at dinner. While the jukebox plays *Don’t Stop Believin’*, and all the family members gather at the diner, Meadow attempts to park the car. When Tony looks up, the scene is rudely cut to black. Years later, viewers still ask themselves: ‘Did Tony Soprano die?’ In 2014, David Chase issued a statement to *Vox* that suggested Tony had not died, but immediately corrected the article in *Vulture* (Zoller Seitz, 2014):

A journalist for Vox misconstrued what David Chase said in their interview. To simply quote David as saying, 'Tony Soprano is not dead,' is inaccurate. There is a much larger context for that statement and as such, it is not true. As David Chase has said numerous times on the record, 'Whether Tony Soprano is alive or dead is not the point.' To continue to search for this answer is fruitless. The final scene of *The Sopranos* raises a spiritual question that has no right or wrong answer.
As this example shows, creators and audiences can have fundamentally different ideas about an ending. David Chase stresses his authorial intent, by discussing his aesthetic choices and purposeful ambiguity, but audiences seek answers. Their questions are literal ones: they fear that Tony and his family got shot. For these “forensic fans” (Mittell 2009), the ending also poses a puzzle of sorts. By interpreting the lyrics of Don’t Stop Believin’ or the number of failed attempts by Meadow to park her car, they hope to find out whether Tony and his family died. What is essentially a spiritual question for creator David Chase is a question about storytelling for his audience. By actively defying closure, The Sopranos ending remains discussed today. These discussions are not trivial since they reveal the importance of narrative closure for fans.

This chapter particularly focuses on the two recent controversial endings of How I Met Your Mother (2005-2014) and The Legend of Korra (2012-2014). Fans criticized the first case in terms of storytelling and the second in terms of representation. I will argue that fan responses to endings can differ fundamentally. Based on the media, genres and tropes that are used, stories raise certain expectations. In other words, fans envision a different ending for a sitcom than an animated series. Methodologically, I interpret how fans respond to endings, and correct them, by focusing on a select corpus of fan edits sampled on YouTube and Vimeo. Fan edits are versions of a film, episode or scene that are modified by a viewer. To create a new interpretation of an existing text, the fan editor can remove, reorder or add material. I argue that fan edits allow audiences to provide their own interpretation of an ending and correct failed closure. As a form of audience participation, such videos provide insights in the workings of productive reception, but also show us how affective our consumption of television really is. Today, audiences are not at the mercy of creators. In our participatory culture, fans have tools and creative skills to contribute to the storytelling
process if an ending does not live up to their expectations. Fan edits are exemplary of this process because they allow fans to achieve narrative closure, but on their own terms.

Narrative Closure

The sense of an ending is an affective experience that is best understood through the concept of narrative closure. Noël Carroll defines narrative closure as “the phenomenological feeling of finality that is generated when all the questions saliently posed by the narrative are answered” (Carroll 2007, 1). As the phrase “phenomenological feeling” implies, closure is affective. It is defined by the audience’s investment, the expectations of the narrative and the intensity with which these desires are met at the ending; “It is the impression that exactly the point where the work ends is the right point” (2007, 2).

Narrative closure can affect the interpretation and resolution of a text in three ways, Carroll (2007) suggests. First, it can supply a satisfactory ending with a sense of completeness as “The impression of completeness that makes for closure derives from our estimation, albeit usually tacit, that all our pressing questions regarding the storyworld have been answered” (2007, 5). Second, closure can partly fail when it does not answer all of the questions that are raised. Plot lines may not be finished in the text and ultimately leave the audience at a loss. For instance, “a character is introduced in a way that grabs our attention, but then disappears” (2007, 6). Third, some endings refuse closure and purposely do not result in a satisfactory ending. Episodic formulas such as soap operas are one example of this; another example is the art movies of the 1960s that deconstruct recognizable narrative structures and thereby fail to meet the audience members’ expectations (2007, 2-3).

In the last case, however, the absence of closure - or purposeful non-closure - does not immediately result in dissatisfaction on the part of the audience. Poetry, for instance, creates
an open structure, and as such, readers prepare themselves for closure. As Barbara Hernstein Smith writes about poetry, “Closure allows the reader to be satisfied by the failure of continuation or, put in another way, it creates in the reader the expectation of nothing” (2007, 34). Unlike the author of a television text or novel, the poet ends at a point of stability, and not at a point where the events are finished and the expectations are met (Hernstein 2007, 35). After that, we may again re-read the work in total and marvel at its design. The sense of completeness in poetry stems from its significant design and thematic whole. As in painting, finality is met when the artwork is completed and the final stroke is made, not when all events are told (Hernstein 2007, 36). The ending of The Sopranos, for instance, can be understood as poetic in this sense.

Although Noel Carroll defines closure as a characteristic of narratives, I argue that the wish for closure also comes from audiences themselves. Even if a narrative formally reaches closure, it may be unsatisfactory for those audience members who want to learn more about the future of the characters. At other times, the audience may not agree with an ending and envision alternatives. In Harry Potter fandom, for instance, many fans were uncomfortable with the epilogue of The Deathly Hallows (2007) that details how the character’s family lives several years after Voldemort’s demise. For them, this ending revealed too much, rather than too little, as was the case with The Sopranos ending. Generally speaking, fan works reveals the need for closure, but always on the fan’s own terms. Closure is not only manifested as the desire towards an ending but also as a hope that characters find happiness and comfort. For many viewers, watching an ending comes with unexpected emotions. To fully experience closure, we want to know what happened to our favorite characters, and what the future holds for them. Only then, can we truly ‘let go’.

Methodology
Informed by work on other fan videos, including fan-made music videos (Russo and Coppa 2012; Turk and Johnson 2012), this chapter draws on analysis of a selected corpus of fan edits. My approach in analyzing these videos on YouTube was observatory rather than participatory. I acknowledge, however, that these channels cannot be analyzed without taking their unique participatory culture, genres and video expressions into account (Burgess and Green 2009). Therefore, I also examined the comment sections, favorites, and the specific cultural context of this social medium. A platform such as YouTube is a community of interest that has grown to have its own cultural conventions, norms, and genres (Pauwels and Hellriegel 2009).

In this article, I read fan edits as a response to the ending of existing stories. The videos were sampled on YouTube and Vimeo through the key words "How I Met Your Mother Alternate Ending," (9,970 results, March 26, 2015) "How I Met Your Mother Edit” (8,220, March 26, 2015). I used a similar strategy for The Legend of Korra by searching the title paired with “alternate ending” (4,470 results, March 26, 2015), “edit” (12,900 results, March 26, 2015) and the additional term “extended” (20,800 results, March 26, 2015). While these results might seem substantial, many of the videos were video blogs, remixes of the soundtrack and other types of responses rather than fan edits. More exhaustive categories were also tried, such as title and “fan video” but did not lead to additional samples. From this corpus, I made a strategic sample. I watched many of the results, but not all of them were clear-cut fan edits of the finales. This process amounted into six fan edits of How I Met Your Mother and eight fan edits based on The Legend of Korra. Analyzing these videos came with methodological challenges. For instance, I knew through blogs and articles that there were more How I met Your Mother fan edits, but many of them had been removed due to copyright infringement. Through other data, I could therefore contextualize these videos but I was
clearly faced with the legal status of fan videos. While the Organization of Transformative Works (http://transformativeworks.org/about/believe) stresses the legality of fan works, networks and channels can remove them. Finally, I analyzed these endings in relation to their source-texts. I made a general list of the shots, sounds and music to clearly see what elements fan editors changed. Moreover, I kept the overall story of the shows in mind to see exactly what themes fans responded to. The videos analyzed on YouTube were considered public data rather than private information.

*How I Met Your Mother*

The American sitcom *How I Met Your Mother* (HIMYM) originally ran on CBS from September 19, 2005, to March 31, 2014. The series is set in Manhattan and revolves around Ted Mosby and his group of friends. As a framing device, Ted, in the year 2013, tells the story to his son and daughter of how he met their mother Tracy. The finale, *Last Forever* (2014), consists of two episodes that narrate the future of the characters and finally amount to Ted, in 2030, finishing his life story to his children. *Last Forever* starts with a flashback in 2005 in which Ted introduces Robin to his friends. The story then continues to Robin and Barney’s wedding, which was the key event of the ninth season. After the wedding, we get to know more about the character’s futures. Robin and Barney, for instance, divorce after three years because Robin’s career put too much pressure on the relationship. Ted and Tracy have two children and finally get married. The most problematic content, however, is featured in the final minutes when it turns out that the mother has passed away, and that Ted is still in love with Robin.

The majority of critics and fans expressed disappointment about the twist ending. In particular, they felt uncomfortable with the revelation that the titular mother had passed away.
and that the show concluded with a rekindled relationship between Ted Mosby and Robin Scherbatsky. While the season revolved around Ted finding new love, and letting go of his ex-girlfriend Robin, the finale turned this around. In *Vulture*, Margaret Lyons writes: “Killing the mom is bad enough, but making this a Ted-and-Robin love story is bailing on the central conceit of the show. You might even call it a slap in the face.” (Lyons 2014).

The disregard for character development, not just of Robin and Ted, but also of Barney, was a point of discussion. The creators felt that they had stayed true to their story. They had already shot parts of the ending, specifically the reaction of Ted’s kids, during the second season. Critic Rick Porter from online site *Zap2it* writes: “Because they were beholden to that ending and that footage of Penny and Luke shot back in Season 2, I and many others are leaving sad and very dissatisfied” (Porter 2014). In response to the criticism, an alternate cut of the ending appeared on the season nine DVD. While the ending does not contain new footage, it is edited in a way that changes the fates of Ted, Tracy and Robin. No one is divorced or dies. Thereby, the authors not only encourage multiple interpretations of the ending, but give viewers the chance to pick their favorite ending. The producers mimic fan practices and even co-opt them by including official, alternative endings.

**Editing a Happy End**

It is not often that fan edits breakthrough in mainstream media, but Ricardo Dylan’s edit of *HIMYM* gained considerable attention in the popular press and was mentioned on sites such as *Buzzfeed* (Broderick 2014). It was, however, removed from YouTube due to copyright infringement. In the edit, Ted and Tracy get married and grow old together. His finale was praised by the media and fans. There is no divorce, death or reconciliation with Robin.
Everyone is happy. The official alternate ending on the DVD box resembles this fan edit very much and also features a voice-over by Bob Saget to provide more closure.

Though fan edits of HIMYM are often removed online, as the first example shows, there are still abundant videos on YouTube and Vimeo. Mike O’Brien’s ending (2014) on Vimeo resembles that of Dylan in that it focuses on the marriage and relationship between Ted and Stacy, and ends with the shot of Ted in 2030, concluding the story to his children. Gergely Horváth’s ending (2014) has a similar focus but does not finish with a shot of older Ted, instead cutting from the train platform on which he meets the mother to the credits.

Humor can be a powerful tool to show dissatisfaction and provide closure. While I expected to find parodies or mock endings too, there were but few. One example is ECUDMB2 ends with a comical scene in which Ted refuses to call Robin, whilst YouTube parodies of the ending by comedians were quite common. Other edits can be read also as a critique not only of the quality, but also the length of the finale. Emma Wong (2014) made a fan edit that is the length of a regular episode that largely skips the years after the marriage of Barney and Robin. There are no feuds between the friends, divorce or death, but just Ted and Stacy getting happily married. I have found few fan edits that stay true to the ending. Alex Hajna’s edit (2014) could be interpreted as such, since she ends with the Ted/Robin scene but has changed the music to I Would Walk 500 Miles by The Proclaimers.

For some fans, the criticism of the show extends beyond the finale. MediaWizard created an alternate ending (2014) that primarily includes footage from the eighth season. S/he has edited it as if Ted meets Stacy (a scene from the ninth season) on the train to Chicago at the end of eight season. The editor writes in the description: “I did this partly because if negotiations with the cast for Season 9 had fallen through, Season 8 would have been the final season for the show. Also, I was not a big fan of Season 9 (excluding the Mother portions) and I felt Season 8 ended on a high point for the series”’. By annulling the ninth season,
MediaWizard created a more personal ending. Thus, fan edits provide the fans of HIMYM with closure. In this case, it is striking that the viewers divert from the source-material considerably to achieve a happy ending for the characters.

The Legend of Korra

*The Legend of Korra* is an American animated television series that aired on the Nickelodeon television network from 2012 to 2014. It was created by Bryan Konietzko and Michael Dante DiMartino as a sequel to *Avatar: The Last Airbender*, which aired from 2005 to 2008. The series explores "bending", the ability to manipulate elements associated with their nation – water, earth, fire and air. Only the Avatar can bend all four elements. Through reincarnation among the different nations, the Avatar maintains peace and balance in the world. Another important characteristic of this story is the spirit world, which is the source of the Avatar’s powers and only accessible through meditation. In *The Legend of Korra*, portals to that world are opened, and humans consider harvesting the energy of the spirits.

*The Legend of Korra* focuses on Avatar Korra, a seventeen-year-old girl from the Southern Water Tribe. Initially produced as a miniseries, the show is produced in four seasons or “books”. The final season, *Book Four: Balance*, features Kuvira as Korra's antagonist. She is the head of an army that aims to unite the Earth Kingdom, no matter the costs. Korra needs to defeat Kuvira, but she is also struggling with her own mental health after a difficult battle at the end of *Book Three*. In the finale, she goes against Kuvira who is bent on destroying Republic City. Korra prevails and is seen last at the wedding of her acquaintances Varrick and Zhu-Li. With her best friend Asami, she decides to explore the spirit world. The two hold hands as they walk through the portal. The conclusion of the series drew considerable praise.
by fans. Many of them had been rooting for a relationship between Korra and her best friend Asami (“Korrasami”), who had grown closer the previous seasons. The ending celebrated their intimacy, but with some ambiguity. Some fans had wanted to see more, but portraying lesbian relationship on a network such as Nickelodeon can be problematic. In The Mary Sue, Katie Schenkel writes: “…while it’s clear to me that it’s not platonic, I wanted there to be no ambiguity. […] Of course to parallel A:TLA’s finale I’d want them to kiss in the last shot, but even a kiss on the cheek when they spoke at the wedding would have helped” (Schenkel 2014).

The final book of LoK sparked much fan activity. Two animated gifs, in particular, went viral. Artist Drakyx had posted a “Korrasami” gif on Tumblr (figure 1). It portrays the women kissing when they meet again in Book 4 during the episode Reunion. On Reddit, user Viralious (2014) created a finale version of the same gif. These fan works show us how important explicit representation is to fans.

<Figure 1 and 2 here>

Screenshots of animated Korrasami gif by Drakyx and edit by Viralious

Representing Sexuality

The desire to see the sexuality of the main characters confirmed is key to many of the LoK fan videos. As slash fan videos, these fan works are examples of “queer cutting” (Dhaenens 2012). By queering television content, and actively portraying a same-sex relationships, these videos can be read as strategies of resistance, which negotiate popular, heteronormative content. While the Korrasami-pairing was confirmed at the ending, fans desired to see more and engaged in slash activities to portray the relationship.
Three of the videos have included the animated gifs that have gone viral in LoK fandom. The videos by Terry Thomas (2014) and Saiyanduckk (2014), for instance, made montages of the final scene of Korra. Both added Viralious’ animation as a final scene, before the credit roll. Sexuality is also represented explicitly in the video of SpyCeeDice, *The Legend of Korra Alternate Ending* (2014), which focuses on the fight against the colossus and then cuts to the original gif by Drakyx suggesting that Korra and Asami have won the fight and kiss.

While HIMYM spent a considerable part of its two-episode finale on the future of the characters, LoK ends in media res. Korra and Assami are literally going on a new adventure together. What their life will be like, or that of the side-characters, is left to our imagination. Some of the fan edits explore what could have happened to the characters. An example of this is the *Extended Legend of Korra Finale* by Sexual Chainsaw. The vidder narrates the character’s futures through short, characteristic scenes, each ending with a black-and-white still and a short sentence about their life. The video brings to mind epilogue of *Breakfast Club*, since it is set the same song *Don’t You (Forget about Me)* by Simple Minds. The intent with which the video was made, is clearly a comical one, with lines such as: “Korra and Asami founded a five star bed and breakfast in the Spirit World”. It is meant for insiders and celebrates the fandom of LoK Jokes are made about specific aspects of the characters, such as Tenzin being a vegetarian. Sexuality is also a theme in the video, and not just that of Korra and Asami. Same-sex pairings such as Lin/Kya and Wu/Mako are amply referenced in futures that focus on their romances rather than accomplishments (see figure 2). By referencing popular pairings and ideas about Korra fandom, it creates resemblances with fan fiction and other fan works, and thus cannot be read in isolation.

<Figure 3 here>
While this fan edited epilogue shows existing footage, the narrative is largely told through other media. Through captions viewers can imagine these possible scenarios and the video resembles fan fiction in this sense as a textual medium. The music also stands out. The lyrics of *Don’t You (Forget about Me)* emphasize and celebrate narrative closure, after all. What they also celebrate is love. This is not just a playful love, as evidenced by the slash motifs that the video dabbles in. It also augments the love that fans feel for their favorite characters. By addressing fans’ memories of the show, it urges viewers to cherish the characters for a long time. As a parody, the video stresses the sudden ending of the LoK. This is the butt of the joke in other fan videos as well, such as *Legend of Korra Alternate Ending [Leaked]* by FuhrerGoku. In this ending, explained best in the vidder’s own comment, Zhu Li and Varrick are discovered as double agents of antagonist Kuvira. In the video, their wedding is cut to an explosion of the planet.

Bridging the finale with other media, and even fan works, is a major theme the LoK videos that I examined. *Korra Book 4 Alternate Fan Ending – The Last Airbender Version* by Tiger 2 (2014) has replaced the score of the ending scene and credit roll with the theme of the original *Avatar: The Last Airbender*. Thereby, the fan creates a clear relationship between the two shows, and between Korra and the previous avatar Aang. The score also makes for a perfect conclusion of the *Avatar* franchise, allowing us to reflect on the finale of not just LoK, but the world of *Avatar* as a whole. Referencing pop-culture can be a powerful tool to give new meaning to the source-text. *Legend of Korra: Alternate Ending* (2015) by Meowdeer cuts from Kuvira’s robot blowing up Republic City to shot of the destroyed town, edited in sepia and set to sad violin music. After a cut-to-black, we see a scene from *Jurassic Park* with the main protagonists laughing. User Drake Dragon (2014) produced another parody of a
destroyed Republic City in which the fight against Kuvira’s colossus is interlaced with sequences from an anime and scenes of the characters fleeing from Book Three.

When compared to HIMYM, we see quite different fan works emerge in LoK. Rather than remixes, these videos are mash-ups that rely on animated gifs, scenes and sounds from pop-culture to add to the finale. While the HIMYM editors are concerned with providing alternatives and happy endings, the Korra vidders do not want to correct. They simply want more content from the source-text, be it in terms of explicit LGBT representations, or simply in terms of adventures. This echoes a distinction that Sheenah Pugh made in fan works, particularly fan fiction (2005, 19-20). Some fans want “more from” a source-text: a richer, different and more fulfilling narrative. Others are concerned with seeing “more of” a source-text: they want the characters to continue their adventures. Getting “more from” the text is quite literally the goal of HIMYM fans who edit the ending meticulously to correct it. LoK fans, however, are concerned with getting “more of” the text on a different level. They did not want the adventures of the cast to stop and, on a micro-level, demand several more seconds in which the Korrasami pairing was confirmed with a kiss.

Of course, getting “more from” the LoK finale is also a point for these editors. Through jokes, parodies and incorporation of other fan works, they create intertextual references across media platforms in a mash-up or a slash “palimpsest” of texts (Stasi 2006). Thereby, the fans deepen and extend the text. By including kissing scenes, possible futures, or dystopian parodies, LoK fans not only fulfill their fannish desire, but also respond to network Nickelodeon. While the target group of the network is a younger audience, the older fans have other expectations and critique censorship of the network in relation to LGBT representation. Viewers want to see the romance, politics and war unravel explicitly. This critique is at once a testimony to LoK which started as a family show but gained a mature, cult following.
Conclusion

To reach narrative successful closure, audiences have to be satisfied with an ending. In these two cases, audiences were clearly dissatisfied, which hindered closure, but for very different reasons. HIMYM did not live up to its expectations and audiences felt sucker-punched by an ending that deconstructed the premise of the sitcom altogether. Legend of Korra fans, however, responded more to issues of representation and the implicit policies of the network and production of LoK. In fan works, these concerns are made visible. Fans want what is best for the characters and most in line with the show and storytelling. I focused on a very specific type of fan works, namely fan edits. To let go, editors create closure themselves and correct plot that they disagree with. I have argued that these edits tells us a lot about the storytelling of the shows themselves. HIMYM provided too much closure and had final scenes that could have easily been skipped to produce an interesting ending. The producers even admitted this, by including a happy ending on their own DVD after many fan responses to the ending. LoK, however, shows a different culture of remixing which aims to represent sexuality and mature themes. Other techniques, such as comedy and parody, commemorate the show and its fandom.

The difference in these case-studies, I would argue, is also related to the media in which these television shows have been produced. As a series inspired by Japanese animation, LoK also draws anime fans who have a large culture of editing music videos, creating flash movies and related practices. For them, it easier to add to a finale that is animated. Fan artists can create new animated scenes without being dependent on actors. This problem shown in the official HIMYM alternate ending, in which Bob Saget narrated Ted’s new lines, which is perfectly at odds with the rest of the series. Live-action poses limits to fan editors that
animation does not. All in all, these fan edits have shown us a sincere desire. Fans strive for closure, but if a finale disappoints them, closure becomes difficult. When the source-text hinders closure, then fan works are a solution - a way to let go.

Bibliography


Fan Works

Alex Hajna, *Re-edit of HIMYM ending scene*. April 11, 2014, accessed January 12, 2016,
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xKJ2Wed2U-Y

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pQx7X2E9h5o


https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tdVHRii3Low

https://vimeo.com/91092493

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qXdecCD72RY

http://vimeo.com/90945778

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ulvqWl9Sn0A

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GAeHffsIrHA


